

ASPEN CASEBOOK SERIES

*EPSTEIN
SHARKEY*

**CASES AND MATERIALS
ON TORTS**

*Tenth
Edition*



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

CASES AND MATERIALS ON TORTS

EDITORIAL ADVISORS

Vicki Been

Elihu Root Professor of Law
New York University School of Law

Erwin Chemerinsky

Dean and Distinguished Professor of Law
University of California, Irvine, School of Law

Richard A. Epstein

Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
James Parker Hall Distinguished Service
Professor of Law, Emeritus and
Senior Lecturer in Law
The University of Chicago

Ronald J. Gilson

Charles J. Meyers Professor of Law and Business Stanford University
Marc and Eva Stern Professor of Law and Business
Columbia Law School

James E. Krier

Earl Warren DeLano Professor of Law
The University of Michigan Law School

Richard K. Neumann, Jr.

Professor of Law
Hofstra University School of Law

Robert H. Sitkoff

John L. Gray Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

David Alan Sklansky

Professor of Law
University of California at Berkeley School of Law

Kent D. Syverud

Dean and Ethan A. H. Shepley University Professor
Washington University School of Law

Elizabeth Warren

Leo Gottlieb Professor of Law
Harvard Law School

ASPEN PUBLISHERS

CASES AND MATERIALS ON TORTS

Tenth Edition

Richard A. Epstein

*Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law
New York University School of Law
Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow
The Hoover Institution
Stanford University
James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Law,
Emeritus and Senior Lecturer
The University of Chicago*

Catherine M. Sharkey
*Crystal Eastman Professor of Law
New York University School of Law*



Copyright © 2012 Richard A. Epstein and Catherine M. Sharkey
Published by Wolters Kluwer Law & Business in New York.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.wolterskluwerlb.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.wolterskluwerlb.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business
Attn: Order Department
PO Box 990
Frederick, MD 21705

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 978-1-4548-1994-3

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Epstein, Richard Allen, 1943-

Cases and materials on torts / Richard A. Epstein, Catherine M. Sharkey. — 10th ed.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-7355-9992-5

1. Torts — United States — Cases. 2. Liability (Law) — United States--Cases. 3. Damages — United States — Cases. I. Sharkey, Catherine M. II. Title.

KF1249.E67 2012

346.7303 — dc23

2011053422

About Wolters Kluwer Law & Business

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business is a leading global provider of intelligent information and digital solutions for legal and business professionals in key specialty areas, and respected educational resources for professors and law students. Wolters Kluwer Law & Business connects legal and business professionals as well as those in the education market with timely, specialized authoritative content and information-enabled solutions to support success through productivity, accuracy and mobility.

Serving customers worldwide, Wolters Kluwer Law & Business products include those under the Aspen Publishers, CCH, Kluwer Law International, Loislaw, Best Case, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs family of products.

CCH products have been a trusted resource since 1913, and are highly regarded resources for legal, securities, antitrust and trade regulation, government contracting, banking, pension, payroll, employment and labor, and healthcare reimbursement and compliance professionals.

Aspen Publishers products provide essential information to attorneys, business professionals and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, the product line offers analytical and practical information in a range of specialty practice areas from securities law and intellectual property to mergers and acquisitions and pension/benefits. Aspen's trusted legal education resources provide professors and students with high-quality, up-to-date and effective resources for successful instruction and study in all areas of the law.

Kluwer Law International products provide the global business community with reliable international legal information in English. Legal practitioners, corporate counsel and business executives around the world rely on Kluwer Law journals, looseleaves, books, and electronic products for comprehensive information in many areas of international legal practice.

Loislaw is a comprehensive online legal research product providing legal content to law firm practitioners of various specializations. Loislaw provides attorneys with the ability to quickly and efficiently find the necessary legal information they need, when and where they need it, by facilitating access to primary law as well as state-specific law, records, forms and treatises.

Best Case Solutions is the leading bankruptcy software product to the bankruptcy industry. It provides software and workflow tools to flawlessly streamline petition preparation and the electronic filing process, while timely incorporating ever-changing court requirements.

ftwilliam.com offers employee benefits professionals the highest quality plan documents (retirement, welfare and non-qualified) and government forms (5500/PBGC, 1099 and IRS) software at highly competitive prices.

MediRegs products provide integrated health care compliance content and software solutions for professionals in healthcare, higher education and life sciences, including professionals in accounting, law and consulting.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business, a division of Wolters Kluwer, is headquartered in New York. Wolters Kluwer is a market-leading global information services company focused on professionals.

To the next generation

Bella Catherine Pianko
Noah David Pianko
Caleb Emmett Sharkey
Phoebe Lila Sharkey

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

Contents

Preface

Acknowledgments

Introduction

Torts Treatise: List of Chapters

List of Abbreviations

PART ONE. PHYSICAL AND EMOTIONAL HARMS

1. Intentional Harms: The Prima Facie Case and Defenses
2. Strict Liability and Negligence: Historic and Analytic Foundations
3. Negligence
4. Plaintiff's Conduct
5. Causation
6. Affirmative Duties
7. Strict Liability
8. Products Liability
9. Damages
10. The Institution of Insurance
11. The No-Fault Systems

PART TWO. TORTS AGAINST NONPHYSICAL INTERESTS

12. Defamation
13. Privacy
14. Misrepresentation
15. Economic Harms
16. Tort Immunities

Table of Cases

Table of Restatement Sections

Table of Secondary Authorities

Index

CONTENTS

Preface

Acknowledgments

Introduction

Torts Treatise: List of Chapters

List of Abbreviations

PART ONE. PHYSICAL AND EMOTIONAL HARMS

Chapter 1. Intentional Harms: The Prima Facie Case and Defenses

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Physical Harms

1. Trespass to Person and Land

Vosburg v. Putney

Dougherty v. Stepp

2. Defenses to Intentional Torts

a. Consensual Defenses

Mohr v. Williams

Canterbury v. Spence

Hudson v. Craft

b. Insanity

McGuire v. Almy

c. Self-Defense

Courvoisier v. Raymond

d. Defense of Property

Bird v. Holbrook

e. Necessity

Ploof v. Putnam

Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co.

Thomson, The Trolley Problem

Section C. Emotional and Dignitary Harms

1. Assault

I. de S. and Wife v. W. de S.

Tuberville v. Savage

Blackstone, Commentaries

2. Offensive Battery

Alcorn v. Mitchell

3. False Imprisonment

Bird v. Jones

Coblyn v. Kennedy's, Inc.

4. The Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress: Extreme and Outrageous Conduct

Wilkinson v. Downton
Restatement (Second) of Torts §46

Chapter 2. Strict Liability and Negligence: Historic and Analytic Foundations

Section A. Introduction

Section B. The Formative Cases

The Thorns Case (Hull v. Orange)

Weaver v. Ward

Section C. The Forms of Action

1. The Significance of the Forms

2. Trespass and Case

Scott v. Shepherd

3. The Breakdown of the Forms of Action

Section D. Strict Liability and Negligence in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century

Brown v. Kendall

Fletcher v. Rylands (1865)

Fletcher v. Rylands (1866)

Rylands v. Fletcher

Brown v. Collins

Powell v. Fall

Holmes, The Common Law

Section E. Strict Liability and Negligence in Modern Times

Stone v. Bolton

Bolton v. Stone

Hammtree v. Jenner

Chapter 3. Negligence

Thayer, Public Wrong and Private Action

Green, Judge and Jury

Section A. Introduction

Section B. The Reasonable Person

Vaughan v. Menlove

Holmes, The Common Law

Roberts v. Ring

Daniels v. Evans

Breunig v. American Family Insurance Co.

Fletcher v. City of Aberdeen

Denver & Rio Grande R.R. v. Peterson

Section C. Calculus of Risk

Blyth v. Birmingham Water Works

Eckert v. Long Island R.R.

Terry, Negligence

Seavey, Negligence — Subjective or Objective?

Osborne v. Montgomery

Cooley v. Public Service Co.

United States v. Carroll Towing Co.

Ross, Settled Out of Court
Andrews v. United Airlines

Section D. Custom

Titus v. Bradford, B. & K. R. Co.
Mayhew v. Sullivan Mining Co.
The T.J. Hooper (1931)
The T.J. Hooper (1932)
Lama v. Borrás
Schuck, Rethinking Informed Consent
Canterbury v. Spence

Section E. Statutes and Regulations

Anon.
Thayer, Public Wrong and Private Action
Osborne v. McMasters
Restatement (Second) of Torts §286
Restatement (Third) of Torts: Liability for Physical and Emotional Harm
§14
California Evidence Code §669(a)
Martin v. Herzog
Uhr v. East Greenbush Cent. Sch. Dist.

Section F. Judge and Jury

Holmes, The Common Law
Baltimore and Ohio R.R. v. Goodman
Pokora v. Wabash Ry.

Section G. Proof of Negligence

1. Methods of Proof
2. Res Ipsa Loquitur
Byrne v. Boadle
Colmenares Vivas v. Sun Alliance Insurance Co.
Ybarra v. Spangard

Chapter 4. Plaintiff's Conduct

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Contributory Negligence

1. Basic Doctrine

Butterfield v. Forrester
Beems v. Chicago, Rock Island & Peoria R.R.
Schwartz, Tort Law and the Economy in Nineteenth-Century America: A
Reinterpretation
Gyerman v. United States Lines Co.
LeRoy Fibre Co. v. Chicago, Milwaukee & St. Paul Ry.
Derheim v. N. Fiorito Co.

2. Last Clear Chance

Fuller v. Illinois Central R.R.
Restatement (Second) of Torts §§479,

Section C. Imputed Contributory Negligence

Section D. Assumption of Risk

Lamson v. American Axe & Tool Co.

Murphy v. Steeplechase Amusement Co.

Dalury v. S-K-I Ltd.

Section E. Comparative Negligence

1. At Common Law

Lombard Laws, King Luitprand

Beach, Contributory Negligence

Prosser, Comparative Negligence

Li v. Yellow Cab Co. of California

2. By Legislation

Federal Employers' Liability Act

New York

Pennsylvania

Wisconsin

Restatement (Third) of Torts — Apportionment of Liability §7

Chapter 5. Causation

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Cause in Fact

1. The "But For" Test

New York Central R.R. v. Grimstad

Zuchowicz v. United States

2. Joint and Several Liability and Multiple Causes

a. Joint and Several Liability

Union Stock Yards Co. of Omaha v. Chicago, Burlington, & Quincy R.R.

California Civil Procedure Code §§875-877.5

American Motorcycle Association v. Superior Court

b. Multiple Sufficient Causes

Kingston v. Chicago & N.W. Ry.

3. Indeterminate Causes

a. Alternative Liability

Summers v. Tice

b. Market Share Liability

Sindell v. Abbott Laboratories

c. Loss of Chance of Survival

Herskovits v. Group Health Cooperative

4. Proof of Factual Causation

General Electric Co. v. Joiner

5. Settlement Rules for Joint Tortfeasors

McDermott, Inc. v. AmClyde and River Don Castings, Ltd.

Section C. Proximate Cause (Herein of Duty)

1. Physical Injury

Bacon, The Elements of the Common Lawes of England

Street, Foundations of Legal Liability

Ryan v. New York Central R.R.

Berry v. Sugar Notch Borough
Brower v. New York Central & H.R.R.
Wagner v. International Ry.
In re Polemis & Furness, Withy & Co.
Overseas Tankship (U.K.) Ltd. v. Morts Dock & Engineering Co., Ltd.
(Wagon Mound (No. 1))
Palsgraf v. Long Island R.R.
Marshall v. Nugent
Virden v. Betts and Beer Construction Company
Hebert v. Enos

2. Emotional Distress

Mitchell v. Rochester Ry
Dillon v. Legg

Chapter 6. Affirmative Duties

Section A. Introduction

Section B. The Duty to Rescue

Luke 10:30–37 (King James Translation)
Buch v. Amory Manufacturing Co.
Hurley v. Eddingfield

Bohlen, The Moral Duty to Aid Others as a Basis of Tort Liability

Ames, Law and Morals

Epstein, A Theory of Strict Liability

Posner, Epstein's Tort Theory: A Critique

Bender, An Overview of Feminist Torts Scholarship

Montgomery v. National Convoy & Trucking Co.

Section C. Duties of Owners and Occupiers

Robert Addie & Sons (Collieries), Ltd. v. Dumbreck
Rowland v. Christian

Section D. Gratuitous Undertakings

Coggs v. Bernard
Erie Railroad Co. v. Stewart
Marsalis v. LaSalle
Moch Co. v. Rensselaer Water Co.

Section E. Special Relationships

Restatement (Second) of Torts §315
Kline v. 1500 Massachusetts Avenue Apartment Corp.
Tarasoff v. Regents of University of California

Chapter 7. Strict Liability

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Trespass to Chattels and Conversion

1. Trespass to Chattels

Intel Corporation v. Hamidi

2. Conversion

Poggi v. Scott

Moore v. Regents of the University of California

Section C. Animals

Gehrts v. Batteen

Section D. Ultrahazardous or Abnormally Dangerous Activities *Spano v. Perini Corp.*

Restatement (Second) of Torts §§519,

Restatement (Third) of Torts: Liability for Physical and Emotional Harm §20

Indiana Harbor Belt R.R. v. American Cyanamid Co.

Section E. Nuisance

1. Private Nuisance

Vogel v. Grant-Lafayette Electric Cooperative

Michalson v. Nutting

Fontainebleau Hotel Corp. v. Forty-Five Twenty-Five, Inc.

Rogers v. Elliott

Ensign v. Walls

Boomer v. Atlantic Cement Co.

2. Public Nuisance

Anonymous

532 Madison Avenue Gourmet Foods, Inc. v. Finlandia Center, Inc.

Camden County Board of Chosen Freeholders v. Beretta, U.S.A. Corp.

Section F. Vicarious Liability

Ira S. Bushey & Sons, Inc. v. United States

Petrovich v. Share Health Plan of Illinois, Inc.

Chapter 8. Products Liability

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Exposition

Winterbottom v. Wright

MacPherson v. Buick Motor Co.

Escola v. Coca Cola Bottling Co. of Fresno

Section C. The Restatements

1. A Tale of Two Texts

Restatement (Second) of Torts §402A

Restatement (Third) of Torts: Products Liability §§1, 2

2. The Theory of Products Liability: Tort or Contract?

Casa Clara Condominium Association, Inc. v. Charley Toppino & Sons, Inc.

3. Proper Defendants Under Section 402A

Section D. Product Defects

1. Manufacturing Defects

Restatement (Third) of Torts: Products Liability §3

Speller v. Sears, Roebuck and Co.

2. Design Defects

Campo v. Scofield

2 Harper and James, Torts §28.5

Wade, On the Nature of Strict Tort Liability for Products

a. Development of the Negligence Test

- Volkswagen of America, Inc. v. Young*
- b. Consumer Expectations versus Risk-Utility Tests
 - Barker v. Lull Engineering Co.*
- c. Third Restatement and the Alternative Design Test
- 3. The Duty to Warn
 - MacDonald v. Ortho Pharmaceutical Corp.*
 - Vassallo v. Baxter Healthcare Corp.*
 - Hood v. Ryobi America Corp.*
- Section E. Plaintiff's Conduct
 - Daly v. General Motors Corp.*
- Section F. Federal Preemption
 - Geier v. American Honda Motor Co.*
 - Wyeth v. Levine*

Chapter 9. Damages

- Sullivan v. Old Colony Street Ry.*
- Zibbell v. Southern Pacific Co.*
- Section A. Introduction
- Section B. Recoverable Elements of Damages
 - 1. Pain and Suffering
 - McDougald v. Garber*
 - 2. Economic Losses
 - O'Shea v. Riverway Towing Co.*
 - Duncan v. Kansas City Southern Railway*
- Section C. Wrongful Death and Loss of Consortium
 - 1. Wrongful Death
 - a. History
 - b. Measure of Damages
 - 2. Survival of Personal Injury Actions
 - 3. Actions for Loss of Consortium
 - a. History
 - b. Parents and Children
 - c. Nontraditional Families
 - d. Damages in Consortium Cases
- Section D. Punitive Damages
 - Kemezy v. Peters*
 - State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Co. v. Campbell*
- Section E. Contingency Fees, Class Actions, Fee-Shifting, Sale of Tort Claims, Litigation Insurance, and Alternative Litigation Financing
 - 1. Contingency Fees
 - 2. Class Actions
 - 3. Fee Shifting
 - 4. Sale of Tort Claims
 - 5. Litigation Insurance
 - 6. Alternative Litigation Financing
- Section F. Collateral Benefits

Harding v. Town of Townshend

Chapter 10. The Institution of Insurance

Section A. Introduction

Section B. The Scope of Insurance Coverage

1. Modern Tort Litigation

Dimmitt Chevrolet, Inc. v. Southeastern Fidelity Insurance Corp.

2. Coverage for Cumulative Trauma Cases Under the CGL

3. Automobile Insurance Coverage

a. The March to Compulsory Insurance

b. The Standard Provisions of the Automobile Insurance Contract

Section C. Ambiguities in the Position of the Liability Insurer

1. The Duty to Defend

2. The Obligation to Act in Good Faith

Crisci v. Security Insurance Co.

Chapter 11. The No-Fault Systems

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Workers' Compensation

1. Historical Origins

2. The Scope of Coverage: "Arising Out of and in the Course of Employment"

Clodgo v. Industry Rentavision, Inc.

Wilson v. Workers' Compensation Appeals Board

3. Benefits Under the Workers' Compensation Statutes

4. Exclusive Remedy

Rainer v. Union Carbide Corporation

Section C. No-Fault Insurance

1. Automobile No-Fault Insurance

American Bar Association, Special Committee on Automobile Insurance

Legislation, Automobile No-Fault Insurance

Epstein, Automobile No-Fault Plans: A Second Look at First Principles

Pinnick v. Cleary

2. No-Fault Insurance for Medical and Product Injuries

Pafford v. Secretary of Health and Human Services

Section D. The 9/11 Victim Compensation Fund

Section E. The New Zealand Plan

Report of the Royal Commission of Inquiry, Compensation for Personal Injury in New Zealand

Accident Compensation: Options for Reform

PART TWO. TORTS AGAINST NONPHYSICAL INTERESTS

Chapter 12. Defamation

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Publication

Doe v. Gonzaga University

Firth v. State of New York

Blumenthal v. Drudge

Section C. False or Defamatory Statements

Parmiter v. Coupland

Muzikowski v. Paramount Pictures Corp.

Wilkow v. Forbes, Inc.

Section D. Libel and Slander

Varian Medical Systems, Inc. v. Delfino

Section E. Basis of Liability: Intention, Negligence, and Strict Liability in Defamation

E. Hulton & Co. v. Jones

Section F. Damages

1. Special Damages

Terwilliger v. Wands

Ellsworth v. Martindale-Hubbell Law Directory, Inc.

2. General Damages

McCormick, Damages

Faulk v. Aware, Inc. (1962)

Faulk v. Aware, Inc. (1963)

3. Other Remedies

a. Injunctions

b. Retraction

c. Reply Statutes

Section G. Nonconstitutional Defenses

1. Truth

Auvil v. CBS 60 Minutes

2. Privileges in the Private Sphere

Watt v. Longsdon

3. Privileges in the Public Sphere

a. Legal Proceedings and Reports Thereon

Kennedy v. Cannon

b. Reports of Public Proceedings or Meetings

Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp. v. Jacobson

c. Fair Comment: Artistic and Literary Criticism Veeder, Freedom of Public Discussion

Section H. Constitutional Privileges

1. Public Officials and Public Figures

New York Times Co. v. Sullivan

Curtis Publishing Co. v. Butts

2. Private Parties

Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc.

Philadelphia Newspapers v. Hepps

Chapter 13. Privacy

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Historical Background

Warren and Brandeis, The Right to Privacy

Prosser, Privacy

Kalven, Privacy in the Tort Law — Were Warren and Brandeis Wrong?
Prosser, Privacy

Section C. Intrusion Upon Seclusion

Restatement (Second) of Torts §652B

Nader v. General Motors Corp.

Desnick v. American Broadcasting Co., Inc.

Section D. Public Disclosure of Embarrassing Private Facts

Restatement (Second) of Torts §652D

Sidis v. F-R Publishing Corp.

Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn

Haynes v. Alfred A. Knopf, Inc.

Section E. False Light

Restatement (Second) of Torts §652E

Time, Inc. v. Hill

Section F. Commercial Appropriation of Plaintiff's Name or Likeness, or the Right of Publicity

New York Civil Rights Law §§50,

Restatement (Second) of Torts §652C

Restatement (Third) of Unfair Competition §46

Doe a/k/a Twist v. TCI Cablevision

Factors Etc., Inc. v. Pro Arts, Inc.

Chapter 14. Misrepresentation 1197

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Fraud

Pasley v. Freeman

Vulcan Metals Co. v. Simmons Manufacturing Co.

Swinton v. Whitinsville Savings Bank

Laidlaw v. Organ

Edgington v. Fitzmaurice

Laborers Local 17 Health and Benefit Fund v. Philip Morris, Inc.

Section C. Negligent Misrepresentation

Ultramares Corporation v. Touche

Chapter 15. Economic Harms 1245

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Inducement of Breach of Contract

The Statute of Labourers (1351)

Lumley v. Gye

Section C. Interference with Prospective Advantage

Tarleton v. M'Gawley

People Express Airlines, Inc. v. Consolidated Rail Corp.

Section D. Unfair Competition

Mogul Steamship Co. v. McGregor, Gow & Co.

International News Service v. Associated Press

The National Basketball Association v. Motorola, Inc.

Barclays Capital Inc. v. Theflyonthewall.com

Ely-Norris Safe Co. v. Mosler Safe Co.
Mosler Safe Co. v. Ely-Norris Safe Co.

Chapter 16. Tort Immunities

Section A. Introduction

Section B. Domestic or Intrafamily Immunities

1. Parent and Child

a. Suits Between Parent and Child

b. Third-Party Actions

2. Husband and Wife

Section C. Charitable Immunity

Section D. Municipal Corporations

1. At Common Law

2. By Statute

745 Illinois Compiled Statutes Annotated

3. Under the Constitution

Section E. Sovereign Immunity

Federal Torts Claims Act §§2674,

United States v. Olsen

Berkovitz v. United States

Section F. Official Immunity

Clinton v. Jones

Table of Cases

Table of Restatement Sections

Table of Secondary Authorities

Index